



## Comparison of safflower fungicide seed treatments

Barry J. Jacobsen<sup>1</sup>, Jerald W. Bergman<sup>2</sup> and Charles R. Flynn<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Plant Sciences and Plant Pathology, 119 Plant Biosciences Building, Montana State University, Bozeman, MT, 59717-3150, U.S.A. <sup>2</sup> Montana State University Eastern Agricultural Research Center, 1501 North Central Ave., Sidney, MT 59270. U.S.A.

### Abstract

Ten fungicide seed treatments were evaluated in 2006 and 2007 for effects on stand, test weight, oil content, seed and oil yield per hectare. Fungicides evaluated included: carboxin + thiram, fludioxonil, azoxystrobin, tebuconazole + metalaxyl + imazalil, mefenoxam + fludioxonil + mancozeb, azoxystrobin + mancozeb, mefenoxam + thiram, difenoconazole + mefenoxam, and mefenoxam + fludioxonil + azoxystrobin. Seed lots of the cultivars Nutrasaff and Montola 2004 with 10-20% infection with *Alternaria carthami* were planted at the Montana State University Eastern Agricultural Research Station at Sidney, MT, USA. For the cultivar Nutrasaff, no fungicide treatment statistically increased stand, test weight, oil content, seed yield or oil yield per hectare over untreated seed ( $P < 0.05$ ). For the cultivar Montola 2004, no fungicide treatment statistically increased stand, test weight, or percent oil over untreated seed ( $P < 0.05$ ). Seed treatment with mefenoxam + thiram and difenoconazole + mefenoxam statistically increased total seed yield and oil yield per hectare over untreated seed ( $P < 0.05$ ) for the cultivar Montola 2004. Treatment with mefenoxam + fludioxonil + mancozeb and azoxystrobin + mancozeb increased total seed yield and oil yield per hectare over untreated seed ( $P < 0.1$ ) for the cultivar Nutrasaff. Stand establishment averaged 81.7% and 85.3% for untreated seed for the cultivars Nutrasaff and Montola 2004 respectively. All seed treatments reduced detectable seed infection by *Alternaria carthami* ( $P < 0.05$ ).

**Key words:** fungicide seed treatment - soilborne pathogens - *Alternaria* seed infection-safflower - *Carthamus tinctorius*

### Introduction

Fungicide seed treatments are used on safflower to control pre and post emergent damping-off caused by soilborne fungi such as *Pythium ultimum* Trow, *P. aphaidermatum* (Edson) Fitz, *P. debaryanum* Hess, *P. splendens* Braun, *P. acanthium* Drechsler, *P. myriotylum* Drechsler, *Rhizoctonia solani* Kuhn, *Phytophthora drechsleri* Tucker, *P. cryptogea* Pethyb. and Laff., and *P. parasitica* Dast (Mündel and Huang, 2003). In addition, fungicide seed treatments are recommended for control of two seedborne pathogens, *Puccinia carthami* Cda and *Alternaria carthami* Chowdhury (Mündel and Huang, 2003). Damping-off pathogens typically cause greatest losses where conditions do not favor rapid germination and seedling establishment. Ideally, a single fungicide would control both soil and seedborne pathogens, however no single available fungicide will control the full spectrum of pathogens affecting safflower. In these studies, combinations of fungicides that control the full spectrum of pathogens were investigated. Carboxin, thiram and mancozeb were selected because they have proven activity on seedborne safflower rust and in addition will control seed decay caused by *Pythium* and *Rhizoctonia*. Tebuconazole, difenconazole, and axoxystrobin were selected because of activity on *Rhizoctonia* and *Alternaria*. Fludioxonil was selected because of its activity on pre and post damping-off pathogens such as *Pythium* and *Rhizoctonia*. Metalaxyl / mefenoxam was selected because of its excellent activity on *Pythium* and *Phytophthora* (Lyr, 1995). In addition azoxystrobin has some activity on *Pythium* species. At the time of this writing only thiram, carboxin, fludioxonil and mancozeb are labeled for use on safflower in the USA. Other products evaluated are registered on small grains and would appear to have potential for control of important safflower diseases affecting safflower seeds.



## Materials and Methods

Safflower seeds of the cultivars Montola 2004 and Nutrasaff were treated with the fungicides by shaking in a plastic bag with 60 ml water / kg of seed. Fungicide treatments and rates are given in Table 1. Seeds were air dried following treatment on paper towels and repackaged for planting. Experiments were planted on 18 May in 2006 and 1 May in 2007 using a seeding rate of 22.4 kg/h pure live seed. Plots were four rows wide (61 cm row width) by 9.2 m with the center 6 m of the center two rows harvested. The plot design for all experiments was a randomized complete design with four replications. The previous crop in each year was sugarbeet and the soil type was Savage slit loam. Plots were fertilized to achieve a total available nitrogen supply (residual N plus applied) of 200kg/ha, phosphorous to achieve a minimum of 16 ppm and potassium to achieve a minimum of 250ppm. The herbicide Sonolan 3EC (ethalfluralin, Dow Agrosiences LLC, Indianapolis, IN) was applied at 1590 ml product/ha in 2002 and in addition the herbicide Eptam 7E (EPTC, Gowan, Yuma, AZ) at 1590 ml product/ha was applied in both years. To maintain optimal soil moisture, plots were furrow irrigated in May, June and August of both years. Stand counts were done and percentage emergence calculated based on a pure live seed basis. Seed germination for Montola 2004 were 93% in 2006 and 87% in 2007. Germination for Nutrasaff was 90% in 2006 and 84% in 2007.

Table 1. Seed treatment fungicides and rates tested

| Fungicide-Common Name                 | Fungicide Trade Name    | Rate ml product / 100 kg seed |
|---------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| untreated                             | untreated               | -                             |
| carboxin-thiram                       | Vitavax 200             | 260                           |
| fludioxanil                           | Maxim                   | 30                            |
| azoxystrobin                          | Dynasty                 | 111                           |
| tebuconazole+ metalaxyl+ imazalil     | Raxil MD Extra          | 148                           |
| mefenoxam + Fludioxanil+ mancozeb     | ApronMaxx + Mancozeb    | 148 + 118                     |
| mefenoxam +thiram                     | Apron-Thiram            | 148                           |
| azoxystrobin + mancozeb               | Dynasty + mancozeb      | 111 + 118                     |
| difenoconazole+ mefenoxam             | Dividend XL RTA         | 295                           |
| mefenoxam + Fludioxanil+ azoxystrobin | ApronMaxx 50z + Dynasty | 148 + 111                     |

In a separate trial, seeds of a seed lot of Montola 2004 that was 22% infected with *A. carthami* and that had a germination of 68% were treated with the same fungicide seed treatments. Percentage seeds showing *A. carthami* infection and germination were measured after 7 days germination at 25 °C on cellulose pads. Experimental design was a four replication randomized complete block design.

## Results

Yields and stands are given in Tables 2 and 3. Plots were harvested with a plot combine at approximately 8% moisture on 9, October in 2006 and 21 October in 2007 and yields were all corrected to 8% moisture. Oil content was determined using the protocol for simultaneous determination of oil and moisture contents of oilseeds using pulsed nuclear magnetic resonance spectrometry using a known safflower seed standard (Flynn and Bergman, 2001).



Table 2. Stand, grain yield and oil yield of Nutrasaff safflower treated with fungicides grown at Sidney, MT in 2006 and 2007.

| Treatment             | Percent stand-45 days post plant | Yield kg/h | Oil yield kg/h |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------|------------|----------------|
| untreated             | 80.2 a                           | 2174 abc   | 1075 abc       |
| Vitavax 200           | 73.0 c                           | 2039 c     | 1009 c         |
| Maxim 4FS             | 74.2 c                           | 2220 ab    | 1103 ab        |
| Dynasty               | 80.8 a                           | 2303 ab    | 1141 ab        |
| Raxil MD extra        | 77.5 abc                         | 2241 ab    | 1106 ab        |
| ApronMaxx<br>Mancozeb | 80.0 a                           | 2350 a     | 1169 a         |
| Apron-Thiram          | 78.7 ab                          | 2159 bc    | 1064 bc        |
| Dynasty + mancozeb    | 79.2 a                           | 2222 ab    | 1095 abc       |
| Dividend XL RTA       | 81.7 a                           | 2352 a     | 1172 a         |
| ApronMaxx + Dynasty   | 78.3 ab                          | 2261 ab    | 1111 ab        |
| Flsd 0.05             | 4.5                              | 175.0      | 92             |

Table 3. Stand, grain yield and oil yield of Montola 2004 treated with fungicides grown at Sidney, MT in 2006 and 2007.

| Treatment             | Percent stand 45 days post planting | Yield kg/h | Oil yield kg/h |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|------------|----------------|
| untreated             | 81.7 abc                            | 2528 abc   | 947 abc        |
| Vitavax 200           | 81.7 abc                            | 2398 c     | 889 c          |
| Maxim 4FS             | 80.0 bc                             | 2542 abc   | 956 abc        |
| Dynasty               | 79.0 c                              | 2484 bc    | 923 bc         |
| Raxil MD extra        | 85.3 a                              | 2446 abc   | 936 abc        |
| ApronMaxx<br>Mancozeb | 82.5 abc                            | 2622 ab    | 990 ab         |
| Apron-Thiram          | 80.0 bc                             | 2748 a     | 1049 a         |
| Dynasty + mancozeb    | 81.7 abc                            | 2635 ab    | 993 ab         |
| Dividend XL RTA       | 79.3 c                              | 2782 a     | 1042 ab        |
| ApronMaxx + Dynasty   | 84.2 ab                             | 2609 abc   | 982 abc        |
| Flsd 0.05             | 4.5                                 | 219.0      | 96             |

Table 4. Effect of fungicide seed treatment on *Alternaria carthami* infection and seed germination on Montola 2004 safflower

| Treatment           | Percent germination after 7 days | Percentage seeds or seedlings with visible <i>Alternaria</i> after 7 days |
|---------------------|----------------------------------|---|
| untreated           | 68                               | 22  |
| Vitavax 200         | 77                               | 17  |
| Maxim 4FS           | 79                               | 19  |
| Dynasty             | 82                               | 0   |
| Raxil MD extra      | 78                               | 12  |
| ApronMaxx Mancozeb  | 83                               | 9   |
| Apron-Thiram        | 77                               | 15  |
| Dynasty + mancozeb  | 89                               | 0   |
| Dividend XL RTA     | 84                               | 7   |
| ApronMaxx + Dynasty | 83                               | 0   |
| Flsd 0.05           | 6                                | 3   |



### Discussion

For the cultivar Nutrasaff, no fungicide treatment statistically increased stand, test weight, oil content, seed yield or oil yield per hectare over untreated seed ( $P < 0.05$ ). For the cultivar Montola 2004, no fungicide treatment statistically increased stand, test weight, or percent oil over untreated seed ( $P < 0.05$ ). Seed treatment with mefenoxam + thiram and difenoconazole + mefenoxam statistically increased total seed yield and oil yield per hectare over untreated seed ( $P < 0.05$ ) for the cultivar Montola 2004. Treatment with mefenoxam+ fludioxonil + mancozeb and azoxystrobin + mancozeb increased total seed yield and oil yield per hectare over untreated seed ( $P < 0.1$ ) for the cultivar Nutrasaff. Mefenoxam/ metalaxyl containing seed treatments had numerically higher but not statistically improved stands over untreated seeds indicating that stand reduction by *Pythium* species was likely a factor in these trials. Seeds used in these trials had 10-20% *A. carthami* infection. The lack of improved germination with either mancozeb or azoxystrobin indicates that stand reduction by this pathogen was not important in these field trials.

Seed treatments containing mancozeb difenconazole and azoxystrobin improved germination and reduced *A. carthami* infection more than all other seed treatments although all treatments provided improved germination and reduced *A. carthami* infection over untreated seeds. These seed treatments may be beneficial to safflower producers when *A. carthami* reduces germination.

### References

Flynn, C.R. and Bergman, J.W. 2001. Analytical chemistry methods used in research and development of safflower varieties for the United States Northern Great Plains Region. Proc. of the Vth Int. Saffl. Conf., 23-27 July, Willston, N. Dak.

Lyr, H. Editor, 1995. Modern Selective Fungicides. Gustav Fischer Verlag, Jena. 595 p.

Mündel, H.-H., and H-C Huang, 2003. Control of major diseases of safflower by breeding for resistance and using cultural practices. In: Advances in Plant Disease Management ed. H-C Huang and S.N. Acharya. Research Signpost, Trivandrum, India.